

# Program Review and Outcomes Assessment Subcommittee - Minutes

## San Diego Miramar College

Monday, November 6, 2023 • Zoom 811 9472 1500 Pw: FA2023 • 3:00 p.m. to 4:30 p.m.

**Members: Present:** Patti Manley (Co-Chair), Daniel Miramontez (Co-Chair), Adrian Gonzales, Brett Bell, Michael Odu, Xi Zhang, Joel Palhegyi, Julia McMenamin, Mary Hart, Jon Alva, and Saira Shah. **Absent:** Darren Hall, Catrina Gillus, and Johanna Lindgren. **Guest:** Mara Palma-Sanft

**Vacancies:** Co-Chair; Classified Professionals (2); Faculty BTCWI (1); Health Services Designee (1); Student (3).

- A. **Call to Order:** The meeting was called to order at 3:01 p.m.
- B. **Approval of Agenda and Minutes:** Agenda for November 6, 2023 was moved by M. Hart, seconded by X. Zhang, no nays, discussions, no abstentions, motion carried. Minutes for October 2, 2023 was moved by M. Hart, seconded by P. Manley, no nays, one abstention by J. Alva, motion carried. Minutes for October 16, 2023 was moved by P. Manley, seconded by M. Hart, no nays, one abstention by J. Alva, motion carried.

C. **New Business:**

#	Item
1	<p><u>Student Learning Outcomes Disaggregation.</u> This agenda item was added to begin dialogue on how to approach ACCJC Core Inquiry 2 regarding Student Learning Outcomes (SLO) disaggregation. The ACCJC ISER Team would like to see an update on the College’s progress on the disaggregation and analysis of learning outcomes for subpopulations of students. The ISER Team would also like to learn more about how these results are used for improvement, and how they inform resource allocation (I.B.6). This is a new process with ACCJC to focus on clarification or possible improvement from the institution. Noted was the pilot programs in 2017 where volunteer instructors participated in an outcomes disaggregation, which mirrored the achievement data (match through PREDD). Now with Nuventive (through student IDs), data can be exported, and the college’s Research Office can convert data into demographics and outcomes assessment. Prior faculty training on outcomes assessment was done in Canvas, then Taskstream, and now through Nuventive. Being reviewed is data privacy for students and instructors. Currently, the 2021-2024 Collegewide Program Review &amp; Outcomes Assessment Functional Plan is sunsetting in spring 2024. In particular, the focus of the functional plan was for the college to have a quality program review process (implemented this year). To help in dialogue, one approach is to be intentional about SLO disaggregation and putting this into the next 2024-2027 Collegewide Program Review &amp; Outcome Assessment Plan. Another layered approach (builds out Goal 4) would be looking at the CREATE Program (Culturally Responsive Educators Academy &amp; Training for Equity). Purpose of the program is to aid institutions that develop innovative Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Accessibility (DEIA)-minded and culturally competent professional development training for faculty. Training should focus specifically on nurturing the development of culturally responsive pedagogy and classroom practices for disproportionately impacted and underrepresented communities. When participants go through this professional development opportunity (receiving information for their achievement data), outcomes assessment and disaggregation can be built in as well. Three-part plan/approach would be the Program Review &amp; Outcomes Assessment Functional Plan to memorialize dialogue, process can be built-out through CREATE, and the tools can be Canvas and Nuventive to help with the results for the process. Suggestion was made to bring steps on moving forward to Academic Senate. Response to this core inquiry on SLO Disaggregation will be needed prior to ACCJC site visit on February 2024.</p>
2	<p><u>Public Safety Bachelor’s Degree Workgroup.</u> The College received the approval from the State Chancellor’s Office and ACCJC to offer the Public Safety Bachelor’s Degree. Will now need to look into the feasibility, assessment, and logistics behind degree implementation. Workgroup formed from last spring will reconvene meeting to review the logistics (funding, needs, FTEF, student services, curriculum articulation, resource requests, etc.) for implementation of this bachelor’s degree, and to finish process. To go through curriculum and the governance process for any program initiations (Program Viability Workgroup), program review, Academic Senate, and to College Council. Noted that with the exception of the offer of startup funding, this bachelor’s program must be funded from existing resources. This additional review would be beneficial – to have a wide discussion on institutionalized programs.</p>

D. **Old Business:**

#	Item
1	<p><u>Review of Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs).</u> Ongoing discussion continued. From ListServ, eight community colleges in California responded to question on what was being done with ISLOs in their college. Responses included some haven’t done ISLOs, reconvened workgroups, expanding their ISLOs, and creating rubrics to assess examples. What is being done at Miramar College in regards to ISLOs was shared. Similarities included communication,</p>

	quantitative/qualitative data, understanding sources, reaching out to faculties, and holding information sessions for feedback. Responses from colleges, is if rewriting ISLOs, how will it be assessed and how it will be communicated to faculty. Next steps will be to meet with the college's Research Office to combine efforts from ListServ and Literature Review findings. Findings will be brought back to PROASC for review writeup at the last meeting of the semester.
2	<u>Program Viability: Graphics Program Discontinuance Update</u> . Process has gone through College Council, with next steps to go Curriculum Committee, the District's Curriculum & Instructional Council (CIC as informational), and then the Board this December. Hiccup in approval timeline was due to previous curriculum purview was under Academic Affairs Committee (which no longer exists), and is now under PROASC, then reports to PIERC.
3	<u>Nuventive – Mapping, Collegewide ISLOs, Equity Gaps, College Priorities, Strategic Goals, Guided Pathways</u> . Discussion is being had with Nuventive mapping and how it now ties back to the Core Inquiries received from ACCJC. The ACCJC ISER Team would like to see an update on the new program review process and understand how the college assesses learning outcomes for all instructional programs in student and learning support services. How is the college using SPAS 2.0 Scorecard in relation to the program review process? Nuventive Collegewide Mapping within Quality Program Review Process was previewed (excel report). This report maps programs to student success factors, strategic goals, ISLOs, guided pathways, and the collegewide priorities (from SPAS 2.0). With query on collegewide priorities, results shows collegewide priorities mapped to a specific program or unit (Instructional or Student Services), and how it relates back to program unit goal. Request was made to add another column to the report to indicate resource allocation. Above report could answer inquiry regarding mapping. Discussion will be needed to ask if the college will need to continue to map collegewide priorities, guided pathways, pillars, ISLOs, strategic goals, and success factors. It was agreed that at the very least, the college should be mapping back to collegewide priorities and strategic goals – a required part of program review process and program goals, others will be optional. Other piece/part of core inquiry is the assessment of outcomes for instructional programs. This will be in regards to Program Level Outcomes (PLOs). Report was presented that shows Instructional Programs and PLOs per program (if they have measures and if measures have findings). The College's definition of a "program"(from last accreditation cycle) is when a collection of awards shares the same Program Learning Outcomes). With question on career services as an instructional program (work-based learning), line containing career services was suggested to be removed – to keep as a department and not an "instructional" program.

E. **Announcements:** None.

F. **Adjourned:** Meeting was adjourned at 4:12 p.m.

G. **Next Scheduled Meeting:** Monday, December 4, 2023.

---

**San Diego Miramar College 2020 – 2027 Strategic Plan Goals**

**I:** Pathways – Provide student-centered pathways that are responsive to change and focus on student learning, equity, and success **II:** Engagement-Enhance the college experience by providing student-centered programs, curriculum, services, and activities that close achievement gaps, engage students, and remove barriers to their success **III:** Organizational Health-Strengthen Institutional Effectiveness through planning, outcomes assessment, and program review processes in efforts to enhance data-informed decision making **IV:** Relationship Cultivation - Build and sustain a college culture that strengthens participatory governance, equity efforts, and community partnerships **V:** Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI)-Build an environment that embraces diversity, equity, inclusion, Anti-Racism, and social justice for the benefit of the college community

\*\* [ACCJC Accreditation Standards \(Adopted June 2014\)](#): Mission, Academic Quality and Instructional Effectiveness, and Integrity. II. Student Learning Programs and Support Services. III. Resources. IV. Leadership and Governance.