Institutional Student Learning Outcomes Literature Review

MIRAMAR COLLEGE OFFICE OF PLANNING, RESEARCH & INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTIVENESS

Introduction

This document aims to provide an overview of ISLO research methods and theoretical framework currently practiced by various colleges and universities in California. Each section summarizes the institutional student learning outcomes (ISLO) research conducted at the institution listed.

Each institution referenced will be grouped into one of these three categories: Community Colleges, Public Universities, and Private Universities. The most recent (as of Sep. 2023) links will be provided for each institution listed.

Note: The institutions are selected based on the size of their annual student (undergraduate, graduate) population, excluding those colleges without ISLO/SLO reports. For within San Diego, institutions with an annual enrollment more than 10,000 are listed. For other region in California, institutions with an annual enrollment more than 25,000 are listed.

Community Colleges – San Diego

San Diego Community College District – Mesa College

Institutional Learning Outcomes Definition

1. Critical Thinking
    a. Effectively interpret, analyze, synthesize, explain, and infer concepts and ideas
    b. Construct and deconstruct arguments
    c. Demonstrate quantitative or qualitative competency
    d. Apply problem-solving methods in appropriate context toward making decisions
    e. Come to rational conclusions based on evidence
    f. Think independently, creatively, and logically
2. Communication
    a. Respond appropriately to incoming information in a variety of ways, including: written, oral, visual, auditory, and kinesthetic
    b. Communicate awareness of how diversity and multiple perspectives shape and impact individual experiences and society as a whole
    c. Converse with civility and appropriateness for situational context
3. Information Literacy

a. Gather, analyze, evaluate, and disseminate appropriate information using multiple modalities
b. Utilize 21st-century tools effectively, ethically, and responsibly in information acquisition and distribution
c. Cultivate the skills necessary for life-long learning
4. Professional and Ethical Behavior
a. Practice responsible, professional, and civil conduct in the classroom, workplace, community, digital world, and the natural environment
b. Demonstrate the ability to work both independently and collaboratively
c. Develop the cultural sensitivity needed to resolve conflicts and build alliances
5. Global Consciousness
a. Recognize the interconnectedness of global, national, and local concerns from multiple perspectives
b. Exhibit awareness, appreciation, and respect for the diversity of individuals in one's immediate environment as well as in the global community
c. Apply knowledge of diversity and multicultural competencies to promote equity and social justice in our communities

Graduating Student Institutional Learning Outcome Survey

The goal of the survey was to assess graduating students' perceptions of Mesa College and provide a self-assessment for students related to the college's six institutional learning outcomes. The six institutional learning outcomes include the following:

1. Critical Thinking
2. Communication
3. Self-Awareness and Interpersonal Skills
4. Personal Action and Civic Responsibility
5. Global Awareness
6. Technological Awareness

The survey included two Likert scales each with one item pertaining to each institutional learning outcome. In addition, open ended items related to most valuable learning experiences and suggestions for change or improvement were also contained in the survey.

San Diego Community College District – City College

Institutional Learning Outcomes Definition

1. Communication/Interpersonal Skills
a. Communicate effectively (oral & written) in a variety of settings
2. Critical Thinking
a. Apply critical thinking skills in order to analyze data, text and issues.
3. Analyses/Computation
a. Apply mathematical concepts to perform computations and analyze and interpret data.

4. Cultural Sensitivity/Global Awareness
    a. Successfully interact with individuals representing a wide range of backgrounds, analyze varying cultural beliefs and behaviors, and identify social, political and economic issues relevant to the local community, the state, the nation, and the world.
5. Information Management/Information Literacy
    a. Obtain data from various sources, as well as organize, process and analyze data for relevancy.
6. Personal Responsibility
    a. Demonstrate self-awareness and navigate effectively between one's own value system, professional obligations and responsibilities as a member of society.
7. Civic and Environmental Responsibility
    a. Relate the natural environment to human health and happiness and evaluate the effect of human activity on the welfare of the global environment.

Institutional Student Learned Outcomes (ISLO) 2019 Report

The purpose of the ISLO survey was to assess student perceptions of the college's contribution to their growth in four of the college's seven Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs). The survey was sent to students who recently completed an associate degree at San Diego City College. The 2019 survey focused on the areas of:
1. Cultural Sensitivity/Global Awareness
2. Information Management/Information Literacy
3. Personal Responsibility
4. Civic and Environmental Responsibility

The results will be shared with college stakeholders to engage in dialogue around student learning and student success in the service of inquiry and ongoing improvement.

Palomar College

Palomar College has identified a set of General Education/Institutional Learning Outcomes, which represent the overall set of abilities and qualities a student graduating from Palomar should possess. These outcomes were adopted from the Association of American Colleges and Universities' LEAP framework and modified by Palomar College faculty, administrators, and staff to reflect the College's particular set of values. Each year, the College will assess student progress in achieving these outcomes.

The College Outcomes – Institutional and General Education

Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILO) Definitions
1. Communication Outcomes
    a. **Oral Communication** - communicate orally in order to increase knowledge, foster understanding, or promote change in the audience's attitudes, values, beliefs, or behaviors.
    b. **Written Communication** - the development and expression of ideas in writing.

2. Computation Outcome
    a. **Quantitative Literacy** - reason and solve quantitative problems from a wide array of authentic contexts and everyday life situations.
3. Creative, Critical, and Analytical Thinking Outcomes
    a. **Critical Thinking** - Apply, analyze, synthesize, and/or evaluate information as a guide to belief and action. Practice open-mindedness and recognize one's own biases and assumptions.
    b. **Information Literacy** - Develop a research question; find, evaluate, and ethically use information to satisfy a research question.
    c. **Teamwork** – Apply interpersonal, problem-solving, time management, and other collaboration skills in a team environment.
4. Community, Multicultural/Global Consciousness and Responsibility Outcomes
    a. **Civic Knowledge and Engagement** - Find and use sound information and work with others to problem-solve, address current and future societal issues, and improve community life. Demonstrate civic knowledge and engagement, and recognize political and social responsibilities
    b. **Ethical Awareness** - Recognize ethical dilemmas, and consider integrity, honesty, and the welfare of others in the ethical decision-making process.
    c. **Intercultural Knowledge** - Understand, relate and address cultural dynamics in a supportive, equitable manner, and clearly communicate socio-political cultural differences which allow for positive inclusivity.

General Education Learning Outcomes (GELO) Definitions

Applies to courses included in a degree, certificate, or GE pattern. The College's general education outcomes include all of the ILOs plus two additional outcomes:

1. Foundational Knowledge of the Discipline
    a. Apply foundational methods of inquiry and analysis of diverse disciplines.
2. Integrative Learning
    a. Synthesis and advanced accomplishment across general and specialized studies.
    b. May be demonstrated through learning communities, service learning, work-based learning, engagement through the arts, capstone projects, etc.

Assessment Model

This [linked chart](#) illustrates how the assessment of college learning outcomes are initiated, analyzed, documented, and shared.

Cuyamaca College

Institutional Learning Outcomes

Students who complete a program of study leading to an associate degree or Certificate of Achievement are expected to achieve the following Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs).

Reference: ACCJC Standard II.A.11

1. **Communication Competency**: Students will communicate information, arguments and opinions effectively to different audiences, through various modalities, including listening, speaking and writing.
2. **Critical Thinking Competency**: Students will analyze and evaluate qualitative and quantitative information, and synthesize findings to make decisions within various contexts.
3. **Cultural Competency**: Students will interact effectively with others, considering their diverse backgrounds, and work well in cross-cultural situations.
4. **Professional Responsibility**: Students will practice ethical and civil conduct in professional environments, as well as resolve conflicts and build alliances.

SLO (Student Learning Outcomes) & SAOs (Service Area Outcomes) Assessment Updates

ISLO Assessment

Cuyamaca College assesses ILOs two ways, through indirect, qualitative assessment, and through interdisciplinary direct assessment.

Indirect Assessment: Cuyamaca College has surveyed graduating students about their learning experiences throughout their time at the college. The survey asked students to report their skill levels corresponding to the college's ILOs and offered them the opportunity to answer open-ended questions about their challenges and successes at the college. The responses to the open-ended questions yielded valuable insights about student experiences, which the college incorporated into institution-wide planning meetings.

Direct Assessment: Cuyamaca College has directly assessed ILOs through a team of interdisciplinary faculty who developed a common method of assessment (assignment prompt and rubric) specific to one of the College's ILOs. Faculty then facilitated that assessment across participating courses and collectively analyzed assessment results. For more information about the results of that pilot project specifically from the 2020-21 academic year, please see this ILO Direct Assessment Report. The college hopes to scale the project in future semesters to directly assess other ILOs, and particularly to build upon the findings of the initial project to further the practice of inclusive and equitable assessments college-wide.

Learning Outcomes & Assessment.

Public Universities – San Diego

University of California, San Diego

Learning Outcomes

We engage in outcomes assessment to improve student learning, programming, and the administration of applicable programs, processes, and policies. Specifically, we focus on the following student learning outcomes:

1. Greater knowledge, awareness, and understanding of our standards and expectations of conduct, consequences for violations, and the impact of their actions on themselves and others.
2. Identify and access relevant campus resources.
3. Articulate the impact of their decision-making on themselves and others.
4. Identify and articulate risk reduction strategies, how they make decisions, and the impact of their behavior on themselves and others.
5. Articulate a greater understanding of our processes and their roles within them.

UC San Diego only reports Program Learning Outcomes on its website. Information regarding Institutional Learning Outcomes assessments was unable to be found.

San Diego State University

Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs)

In 2020, San Diego State University established seven "Institutional Learning Outcomes" (ILOs) to guide and connect our broad educational mission through our diverse degree offerings:

1. Demonstrate expertise in integrating ideas, methods, theories, and practices within and across academic/disciplinary areas of study. (**Disciplinary/Interdisciplinary Knowledge**)
2. Seek, analyze, contextualize, and incorporate information to expressly enrich understanding of the world. (WASC **Information Literacy**)
3. Develop the ability to sustain curiosity and to think critically, creatively, and independently. (WASC **Critical Thinking**)
4. Develop skills to collaborate effectively and ethically as leaders and team members. (WASC **Oral and Written Communication**)
5. Communicate effectively within and across academic, professional, and social contexts. (WASC **Oral and Written Communication**)
6. Use deductive reasoning and statistical methods to gather, interpret, and evaluate data critically, in order to assess the reasonableness of solutions to scientific, civic, and personal challenges. (WASC **Quantitative Reasoning**)
7. Demonstrate an understanding of diversity, equity, inclusion, and sustainability through local, global, and ethical perspectives.

While situated within the General Education section of the catalog, these ILOs transcend General Education and serve to inform the design and content of course and degree offerings across the broader University. Furthermore, many of these ILOs are aligned with the four broader Core Competencies for educational institutions as established by our regional accreditor, the Western Association of Schools and Colleges (WASC)

California State University, San Marcos

Undergraduate Learning Outcomes

Students graduating with a Bachelor's degree from CSU San Marcos will be creative, empathetic, and engaged life-long learners who are:

1. **Knowledgeable in their field of study.** Students will be able to:
    a. Articulate, integrate, and apply theories and methods of a field of study to create professional, scholarly, and/or artistic work.
2. **Comprehensive and critical thinkers.** Students will be able to:
    a. Identify key concepts and develop a foundation for future inquiry.
    b. Analyze complex problems and develop solutions by applying quantitative and qualitative reasoning, integrating knowledge and skills from a variety of disciplines.
    c. Construct well-reasoned arguments based on evidence.
3. **Globally and culturally intelligent.** Students will be able to:
    a. Apply multiple perspectives to address local, regional, global, and cultural issues.
4. **Skilled communicators.** Students will be able to:
    a. Communicate clearly and effectively in both written and oral forms.
    b. Tailor communication to audience and context.

Graduate Learning Outcomes

In 2016, the Graduate Council developed and approved general Graduate Learning Outcomes (GLOs). Overall, graduates of the programs will have the knowledge and skills to make contributions to their discipline and to meet the needs of society. Specifically, upon completing their program, graduate students will be innovative practitioners with the ability to:

1. Apply **advanced knowledge, skills, and values** appropriate to the discipline.

2. **Articulate and address critical issues** in their field of study.

3. **Create, analyze, and think critically** at an advanced level.

4. **Master new and various methods and technologies** as appropriate to the discipline.

5. **Communicate**, at an advanced level, in oral and/or written form.

6. Recognize, at an advanced level, the **importance of standards of academic and professional integrity**.

General Education Learning Outcomes

Students who have completed their General Education requirements will be able to…

1. Describe and/or apply **principles and methods** that are necessary to understand the **physical and natural world**.

2. Compare and contrast relationships **within and between human cultures**.

3. **Communicate effectively in writing**, using conventions appropriate to various contexts and diverse audiences.

4. Use **oral communication** to effectively convey meaning to various audiences.

5. **Find, evaluate, and use authoritative and/or scholarly information** to comprehend a line of inquiry.

6. Think **critically and analytically** about an issue, idea or problem, considering **alternative perspectives** and re-evaluation of one's own position.

7. Apply **numerical/mathematical concepts** in order to illustrate fundamental concepts within fields of study.

8. Describe the **importance of diverse experiences, thoughts, and identities** needed to be effective in working and living in diverse communities and environments.

9. Apply knowledge gained from courses in different disciplines to **new settings and complex problems**.

California State University, San Bernardino

CSUSB Institutional Learning Outcomes

1. **Breadth of Knowledge**: Students identify, explain, and apply multiple approaches to problem solving and knowledge production from within and across disciplines and fields to intellectual, ethical, social, and practical issues.

2. **Depth of Knowledge**: Students demonstrate a depth of knowledge in a specific discipline or field and apply the values and ways of knowing and doing specific to that discipline or field to intellectual, ethical, social, and practical issues.

3. **Critical Literacies**: Students analyze the ways artistic, oral, quantitative, technological and written expression and information both shape and are shaped by underlying values, assumptions and contexts so that they can critically contribute to local and global communities.

4. **Ways of Reasoning and Inquiry**: Students engage in diverse methods of reasoning and inquiry to define problems, identify and evaluate potential solutions, and determine a course of action.

5. **Creativity and Innovation**: Students develop and use new approaches to thinking, problem-solving and expression.

6. **Integrative Learning**: Students connect disciplines and learning experiences to frame and solve unscripted problems using lenses from multiple fields, contexts, cultures, and identities.

7. **Engagement in the Campus, Local and Global Communities**: Students develop dispositions and apply intellect and behaviors to respect and promote social justice and equity on campus and across local and global communities.

8. **Diversity and Inclusion**: Students understand how dynamics within global communities influence the ways in which people see the world. They develop dispositions to respectfully interact and collaborate with diverse individuals and groups and acknowledge their own perspectives and biases.

Link to CSUSB Institutional Learning Outcome Assessment Process schedule

Working groups will be convened for each of the eight ILO. These groups will be inclusive of faculty, staff, administrators, students, and community members.

1. **Collect**: In these years evidence will be accessed and summaries will be compiled for the working group to review
2. **Analyze**: The working group members will determine their method for analyzing the evidence provided per the elements of the ILO
3. **Recommend**: The recommendations of the working groups will be shared with the campus community for comment; the final report of the findings and recommendations will be provided to the President and the Cabinet of Vice Presidents for review
4. **Implement**: Any recommendations accepted and funded will be implemented

Private Universities – San Diego

University of San Diego

Undergraduate Learning Outcomes

Although the Core has more than five outcomes, the five Undergraduate Learning Outcomes are **highlighted in bold** indicating alignment to the Core represent WSCUC's "Big 5" Core Competencies of all regionally accredited institutions: Information Literacy, Critical Thinking, Quantitative Reasoning, Oral Communication, Written Communication.

1. Knowledge
   Students will be able to identify and explain major vocabularies and conceptual, theoretical and methodological foundations of sciences, social sciences, humanities and the arts. Students engage contemporary and enduring questions from these disciplines.
2. **Information Literacy**
   Students will be able to determine the appropriate scope of information needed for a task, know how to access the information, critically evaluate the information and its sources, apply the information accurately to accomplish a specific purpose and use the information ethically and legally.
3. Creative Thinking

Students will be able to evaluate creative process and product, actively incorporate risk-taking into task approaches, apply and critique logically consistent solutions, integrate divergent or contradictory perspectives, extend creative application to new knowledge and transform ideas into new forms.

4. **Critical Thinking**

   Students will be able to consider held assumptions when investigating issues or problems, ask questions and formulate ideas in explaining issues or problems, use relevant and adequate support to reach conclusions, and construct a clearly articulated thesis.

5. Analytical Inquiry

   Students will be able to differentiate and evaluate theories and approaches to selected complex problems within a field of study and at least one other field as modes of inquiry.

6. **Quantitative Reasoning**

   Students will be able to explain and convert information presented into mathematical forms, to form critical judgments and draw appropriate conclusions based on the quantitative analysis of data, and express quantitative evidence in support of an argument or decision.

7. **Oral Communication**

   Students will be able to construct presentations with clear organizational patterns, choose language that is compelling and appropriate, master delivery techniques with confidence, apply a variety of relevant supporting materials and deliver a central message that is precisely stated, appropriately repeated and strongly supported.

8. **Written Communication**

   Students will be able to demonstrate mastery in written communication skills, apply and critically evaluate context and purpose for writing, develop appropriate and relevant content, execute the appropriate conventions particular to a specific discipline and writing task, skillfully integrate credible and relevant sources as evidence, and demonstrate fluency, clarity and stylistic accuracy in their writing style.

9. Second Language

   Students will be able to demonstrate proficiency in interpersonal skills, interpretive skills and presentational skills, and develop the ability to interact appropriately and effectively within diverse social settings and cultural contexts.

10. Diversity-Inclusion-Social Justice

    Students will be able to become critically self-aware, recognize and respect difference, conceptualize and critically articulate the complexities of difference and experience and define difference through the work of social justice.

11. Civic Engagement

    Students will be able to adjust personal perspectives by engaging diverse communities, connect fields of study to community life, develop a sense of civic identity, tailor communication in working with others to promote civic action, demonstrate team leadership through civic engagement activities and commit to work with communities.

12. Integrated Learning

Students will be able to connect relevant experience and academic knowledge, make connections across disciplines and perspectives and adapt and apply skills, abilities, theories or methodologies gained in one situation to new situations.

13. Ethical Reasoning

Students will be able to acquire foundational knowledge about ethics; reason ethically through the application of theories and traditions; analyze contemporary issues; develop, articulate and defend a well-reasoned ethical judgment; and reflect on and evaluate their own ethical decisions, actions, practices and responsibilities.

Graduate Learning Outcomes

1. *Knowledge:* Students will be able to develop specialized field knowledge and integrate knowledge across content areas.
2. *Diverse Perspectives:* Students will be able to evaluate diverse points of view embedded within varying frameworks which may include temporal, cultural, linguistic, sociopolitical or technological contexts.
3. *Critical Inquiry (Competency Skills):* Students will be able to engage in critical inquiry through principle approaches or methods and through effective and ethical information search and evaluation strategies.
4. *Applied Learning:* Students will be able to apply disciplinary or interdisciplinary learning across multiple contexts, integrating knowledge and practice.
5. *Communication:* Students will be able to communicate effectively in presenting ideas orally and in writing (oral communication; written communication).
6. *Ethical Reasoning:* Students will be able to reason ethically in evaluating various perspectives, policies and/or practices relevant to one's field of study.

Community Colleges – Southern California

Santa Monica College

The college provides an ILO report that was most recently updated in 2017. It details the "ILO Mastery Rates" across the past 6 years. The following is a description of the five ILO items the college investigates.

I. Acquire the self-confidence and self-discipline to pursue their intellectual curiosities with integrity in both their personal and professional lives.

Personal Attributes:

- Self-Discipline
- Academic Honesty

- Teamwork and Interpersonal Skills
- Self-Confidence

II. Obtain the knowledge and academic skills necessary to access, evaluate, and interpret ideas, images, and information critically in order to communicate effectively, reach conclusions, and solve problems.

Communication and Analytic Skills:

- Content Knowledge
- Information Literacy
- Technology Literacy
- Aesthetic Engagement
- Quantitative Reasoning
- Critical Thinking
- Oral and Written Communication Skills

III. Respect the inter-relatedness of the global environment, engage with diverse peoples, and acknowledge the significance of their daily actions relative to broader issues and events.

Applied Social Knowledge and Values:

- Employs a comparative and/or global perspective
- Course material has contemporary significance
- Service Learning – social

IV. Take responsibility for their own impact on the earth by living a sustainable and ethical lifestyle.

Applied Knowledge and Valuation of the Physical World:

- Scientific understanding of Earth's natural systems and cycles
- Understanding of human impact on the environment
- Service Learning – environmental
- Conceptual foundations of environmental attitudes, values, and challenges
- Optimize the use of resources through cost containment and sustainability analysis

V. Demonstrate a level of engagement in the subject matter that enables and motivates the integration of acquired knowledge and skills beyond the classroom.

Authentic Engagement:

- Interest
- Valuing academic task beyond the task itself
- Self-efficacy/Empowerment
- Professional relevance

Santa Ana College

The college does not provide further information on ILOs other than the [mission statement](#) indicating that the ACCJC standards "guides institutional decision-making, planning, and resource allocation and informs institutional goals for student learning and achievement".

The college provides samples for other learning outcomes assessments such as [Student Learning Outcomes](#) by department and program.

Mount San Antonio College

The college maps "Team Goals" with four ILOs (detailed below), and provides a comprehensive [document](#) detailing the relationship between ILOs and five Teams: Instructional Team, Student Services Team, Administrative Services Team, Human Resources Team, and President's Office.

Institutional Level Outcomes

1. **Communication**: Students effectively communicate with and respond to various audiences in written, spoken or signed, and artistic forms.
   a. Comprehending, analyzing, and responding appropriately to oral, written, and visual information.
   b. Reading and understanding the content and purpose of written material.
   c. Speaking or signing to increase knowledge, foster understanding, or promote change.
   d. Developing and expressing ideas in writing with clarity and fluency.
2. **Critical Thinking**: Students apply creative, computational, and analytical skills to identify and solve problems, analyze information, synthesize and evaluate ideas, and transform existing ideas into new forms.
   a. Comprehending, analyzing, and responding appropriately to oral, written, and visual information.
   b. Reading and understanding the content and purpose of written material.
   c. Speaking or signing to increase knowledge, foster understanding, or promote change.
   d. Developing and expressing ideas in writing with clarity and fluency.
3. **Information and Technology Literacy**:
   Students will use resources and technologies to locate, evaluate, synthesize, and communicate information in various formats.
   a. Comprehending, analyzing, and responding appropriately to oral, written, and visual information.
   b. Reading and understanding the content and purpose of written material.
   c. Speaking or signing to increase knowledge, foster understanding, or promote change.
   d. Developing and expressing ideas in writing with clarity and fluency.
4. **Personal, Social, Civic and Environmental Responsibility:** Students demonstrate awareness and respect for personal, social, civic, and environmental responsibilities.
   a. Comprehending, analyzing, and responding appropriately to oral, written, and visual information.
   b. Reading and understanding the content and purpose of written material.
   c. Speaking or signing to increase knowledge, foster understanding, or promote change.
   d. Developing and expressing ideas in writing with clarity and fluency.

Pasadena City College

The college website states that their ISLO framework is [in process of update Fall 2023](#). The current website only has a paragraph description of ISLOs.

"Institutional-level Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs) are very broad in scope. In general, through the achievement of PSLOs, students demonstrate specialized knowledge and skills in the discipline, as well as disciplinary achievement of some of PCC's ISLOs (as appropriate to the disciplinary focus), through depth of study within the chosen academic field."

The college assesses the CSLOs (Course-Level Student Learning Outcomes) and PSLOs (Program-Level Student Learning Outcomes) through a variety of ways.

- "Every semester PCC instructor administers an assessment in each of their course sections that is linked to one of the Course Student Learning Outcomes (CSLOs)"
- "Every PCC course has a Course Coordinator who makes sure that all instructors are aware of the assessment details. They will also detail the various threshold values to be assigned (i.e.., what score or result indicates "exceeds", "meets", "partially meets", or "does not meet" a particular learning outcome)."

Public Universities – Southern California

University of California, Los Angeles

Similar to most other UC campuses, the university does not assess institutional student learning outcomes, only program and course level learning outcomes.

University of California, Irvine

Similar to most other UC campuses, the university does not assess institutional student learning outcomes or other SLOs mentioned above. The "Student Outcomes" page of the university website includes graduation & retention rates and employment rates data.

University of California, Riverside

Similar to most other UC campuses, the university does not assess institutional student learning outcomes or other SLOs mentioned above. The "Student Outcomes" page of the university website includes graduation & retention rates, degree awarded, time to degree data.

University of California, Santa Barbara

Institutional Learning Outcomes

The university website lists 6 core values from UCSB's mission statement under "Institutional Learning Outcomes". No further information about ILO assessment can be found.

1. **Connecting Teaching & Research**: students will experience a comprehensive liberal arts education via full participation in a leading research institution.
2. **Learning as Discovery**: students will explore knowledge fields in ways that stimulate independent thought, critical reasoning, and creativity.

3. **Academic Collaboration**: students will join a community of faculty and staff in a culture of interdisciplinary collaboration that is responsive to the needs of our multicultural and global society.
4. **Public Service**: students will help to create and distribute knowledge that advances well-being in our state, our nation, and the world.
5. **Local Context**: students will live and learn in an environment that draws inspiration, opportunity, and advantage from the beauty and resources of our location on traditional Chumash lands at the edge of the Pacific Ocean.
6. **Global Community**: students will utilize and develop their own assets within an inclusive learning community that equitably supports and values learners' personal identities and experiences.

"This educational vision for students at our university informs the priorities and goals of all our faculty and staff, across our various colleges and their constituent departments and programs."

Additionally, the university also describes its Program and Course-Level Learning Outcomes framework in the [same webpage](#).

California State University, Long Beach

Student Success & Institutional Learning Outcomes

New and current students are presented with an intellectually rigorous education in an environment of student-centered learning. CSULB faculty and staff are deeply engaged with promoting student success and expanding opportunities for all students, native or transfer, degree or non-degree. CSULB facilitates success through support initiatives that contribute to student wellness—physical, social, and psychological— and potential to fulfill life goals.

CSULB students and alumni are successful when they *lead personal, civic, and professional lives they consider meaningful*. They pursue their goals with confidence, persistence, and independence and contribute in positive ways to their communities and the public good.

Successful students articulate their own goals and achieve them by demonstrating:

- knowledge and competence in their chosen disciplines and across multiple areas of human experience;
- skills such as critical and creative thinking, written and oral communication, quantitative reasoning, and teamwork; as well as;
- values that promote diversity, curiosity, social justice, global citizenship, community engagement, and life-long learning.

Successful students graduate from CSULB with an intellectually rigorous education, in a time appropriate to their goals and learning, and well prepared for their future as responsible citizens.

Institutional Outcomes highlight the knowledge, skills, and abilities all students are expected to have upon graduating from CSULB. In 2022, CSULB updated its institutional outcomes to reflect the larger mission of the institution.

Graduates of CSULB will:

- Demonstrate a strong liberal education foundation in oral and written communication, critical thinking, quantitative reasoning, and information literacy skills to become civically engaged human beings;
- Integrate foundational knowledge with disciplinary or professional competency to successfully lead personal, civic, and professional lives they consider meaningful;
- Value equity, diversity, social justice, and global citizenship and promote the public good in local, national, and global communities;
- Promote and participate respectfully with our diverse community. Actively engage in self-reflection and critical analysis of one's own perspectives and biases and value other's perspectives;
- Integrate and engage in evidence-based decision making, life-long learning, curiosity, collaboration, innovation, critical thinking and research and creative activities in understanding and analyzing the world;
- Cultivate physical/mental health and well-being of self and community, and promote economic, socio-cultural, and environmental sustainability to thrive.

California State University, Fullerton

University Student Learning Goals

Through campus-wide collaboration, CSUF developed a set of University-wide Learning Goals (UPS 300.003) in May 2014 that were renamed Undergraduate Student Learning Goals in September 2017.

1. Demonstrate **intellectual literacy** through the acquisition of knowledge and development of competence in disciplinary perspectives and interdisciplinary points of view.
2. **Think critically**, using analytical, qualitative and quantitative reasoning, to apply previously-learned concepts to new situations, complex challenges and everyday problems.
3. **Communicate clearly**, effectively, and persuasively, both orally and in writing.
4. Work effectively as a **team member or leader** to achieve a broad variety of goals.
5. Evaluate the significance of how **differing perspectives** and trends affect their communities.
6. Recognize their roles in an **interdependent global community**.

General Education Learning Goals

Led by the Senate GE Committee, incorporating feedback from diverse campus constituents, CSUF developed a set of General Education: Programmatic Student Learning Goals and Learning Outcomes in Spring 2015.

1. Apply their understanding of fundamental concepts, methods, and theories in **natural sciences and mathematics, arts and humanities, and social sciences**.
2. Seek and **acquire relevant information** and apply **analytical, qualitative, and quantitative reasoning** to previously learned concepts, new situations, complex challenges, and everyday problems.
3. **Develop ideas and communicate** them competently and ethically, verbally or nonverbally, both orally and in writing, in a variety of contexts.
4. Develop skills to **collaborate effectively and ethically** as leaders and team members.
5. Develop self-awareness, knowledge, intercultural skills, and critical reflection to **participate** ethically and effectively in **local communities and global contexts**.

Additionally, CSUF assesses Program-Level SLOs. Link to Student Learning Outcomes by College/Program.

Below is a summary of the assessment process and methods CSUF utilizes for Student Learning Outcomes. SLO Assessment Dashboard

Student Learning Outcomes Assessment

The Six-Step Assessment Process
Assessment is an ongoing process aimed at continuous improvement of student learning. At CSUF, assessment follows a 6-step cycle:

The Six Steps of Assessment

1. Develop student learning outcomes that align with the university's mission, the university's student learning goals, and (if applicable) the accreditation requirements of the respective discipline
2. Develop and implement methods of assessment involving direct and indirect and measures
3. Determine criteria for success
4. Collect and analyze data
5. Plan (and execute) improvement actions
6. Document assessment and improvement activities.

Important questions to ask when conducting assessment:

- What do we want our students to learn - at the course level, program level, and the university level?
- How are our students doing? How do we know?

- What evidence do we need to know to determine how well our students are learning?
- How do we use the data to confirm or improve our teaching and learning practices?
- What impacts do our improvement actions have on student learning?
- How are we documenting the assessment and improvement activities and outcomes?

Types of Methods

When assessing student learning, there is a wide range of methods to choose from. Below is a partial list. Please note that the categorizations are not mutually exclusive, e.g., a direct measure can also be a summative one. Remember to consider multiple methods when doing assessment.

Direct assessment methods:

- Course exam, quiz, assignments
- Capstone projects/Final papers
- Student presentations

Indirect assessment methods:

- Student self-reflection essays
- Graduate/Alumni surveys
- Institutional research data (e.g. graduation rate)

Embedded assessment methods:

- In-class problem-solving activity
- Lab report
- Student portfolio consisting of student assignments in the course

"Add-on" or external assessment methods:

- Published tests
- Juried review of student artifacts
- Clinical interview of students' problem-solving

Absolute (non-value-added) assessment methods:

- Licensure exams
- Standardized tests (e.g. SAT, GRE)
- Proficiency test to place students in different tracks

Value-added assessment methods:

- Pre/Post tests
- Entrance/Exit Interviews

Formative assessment methods:

- One-minute paper in class
- Concept mapping
- Small group analysis

Summative assessment methods:

- Final exam
- Concept inventory
- Student post-participation experience focus group

Assessment Mapping

With the student learning outcomes (SLOs) developed, the next step is to figure out how to assess each of the SLOs. A useful approach to do so is to use the Curriculum Map as the foundation to build an **"Assessment Map"** that specifies how each SLOs will be measured. This mapping exercise helps ensure the SLOs are assessed in a systematic and thoughtful manner, ideally capturing student growth throughout the curriculum, and employing multiple methods and measures.

Using the Assessment Maps for the SLOs as guides, each program should develop a **Multi-year Assessment Plan**.

Here are some guidelines on how to develop a multi-year assessment plan (adapted from [University of Hawaii, Manoa](#)):

- Limit the number of SLOs to 5-7.
- Determine a realistic assessment plan cycle, i.e. how long (e.g. 7 years) your program can complete meaningful assessment of all SLOs.
- Create a multi-year assessment plan that assesses 1-2 SLOs a year; do not implement a comprehensive assessment plan that includes all SLOs at once.
- Make sure the assessment plan is developed and carried out by the entire program/department; this should not be the Chair's creation, or the concern of a small number of faculty.
- Use multiple methods and data sources to collect evidence of student learning.
- Think about how the data can be used to inform practice change; focus on evidence that can be acted upon.
- Make sure the assessment plan is manageable and sustainable over time.
- Allow flexibility in the assessment plan to "carry over" SLOs from one year to the next, particularly if the assessment findings are unsatisfactory and improvement actions are implemented.

Assessment Reporting

CSUF uses an online, centralized assessment planning, management and reporting system (AMS). Access AMS through university portal or at https://solutions.nuventive.com.

Guides and Examples

[Assessment Report Example](#) : Example of a complete SLO for annual assessment report.

[Assessment Feedback Rubric](#) : The rubric used to review the assessment reports.

[Developing an Outcome: Assessment Steps 1-3 Worksheet](#) : Use this worksheet to develop an Outcome following the University 6-Step assessment process.

[Guidelines for Reporting Learning Assessment Activity in the AMS](#) : Use these writing prompts to structure assessment reports.

[Guidelines for Reporting Performance Assessment Activity in the AMS](#) : Use these writing prompts to structure assessment reports.

California State University, Northridge

Undergraduate Institutional Learning Outcomes

CSUN outlines the 7 Institutional Student Learning Outcomes below, while no information on assessment can be found.

Communication Spoken/Signed

Education for understanding the basic concepts and practices associated with public speaking or signing includes making public presentations of one's own thoughts and research.

1. Apply critical thinking skills when listening, reading, thinking, and speaking or signing.
2. Create, organize and support ideas for various types of spoken and signed presentations.
3. Evaluate contexts, attitudes, values and responses of different audiences.
4. Identify, evaluate and apply different styles of presentation, utilizing effective delivery techniques in public speaking or signing.
5. Demonstrate acceptable ethical standards in research and presentation of materials, including proper verbal or signed citations.

Communication Written

Education for understanding the basic concepts and practices associated with written communication includes analyzing and reflecting on complex topics and appropriately synthesizing one's own and others' ideas in clearly written and well-organized edited American English.

1. Analyze and compare perspective, meaning and style in different texts, including those that reflect multicultural images and voices.
2. Construct a theme or thesis and organize and develop a substantial, balanced and convincing defense of it in a voice, tone, language and format (e.g., essay autobiography, report, editorial, case study, inquiry and research) appropriate to the purpose of the writing.
3. Use logical support, including informed opinion and fact, as well as their interpretations, to develop ideas, avoiding fallacies, biased language and inappropriate tone.
4. Demonstrate satisfactory competence in the conventions of Edited American English and the elements of a presentation (including layout, format and printing).
5. Select and incorporate ideas derived from a variety of sources, such as library electronic and print resources, books, journals, the Internet and interviews, and document them responsibly and correctly.
6. Apply a variety of strategies for planning, outlining, drafting, revising and editing written work.

Community Engagement

Education for community-based learning is a pedagogy that integrates explicit academic learning objectives, preparation and reflection with meaningful work in the community. It focuses on learning through assignments that involve the application of theory to practice and result in improved student learning outcomes, including enhanced understanding of course content, critical-thinking skills, retention, sensitivity to diversity and the ability to apply the academic concept.

1. Develop an understanding of the social, cultural and civic aspects of their personal identities. (Self and Social Awareness)
2. Develop an understanding of social responsibility and the connections between short-term community service and greater long-term societal well-being. (Service and Social Responsibility)
3. Develop an understanding of how the actions of individuals and social systems bring about both equity and inequity in communities and society. (Community and Social Justice)
4. Develop career skills needed to address the cultural, linguistic, humanistic, artistic, economic, scientific, social and/or civic issues of our time. (Career Development and Professional Development)
5. Learn from and work responsively and inclusively with diverse individuals, groups and organizations to build more just, equitable and sustainable communities. (Multicultural Community Building/Civic Engagement)

Critical Thinking

Education for critical thinking includes analyzing information and ideas carefully and logically from multiple perspectives and developing reasoned solutions to problems.

1. Explain and apply the basic concepts essential to a critical examination and evaluation of argumentative discourse.
2. Use investigative and analytical thinking skills to examine alternatives, explore complex questions and solve challenging problems.
3. Synthesize information in order to arrive at reasoned conclusions.
4. Evaluate the logic and validity of arguments, as well as the relevance of data and information.
5. Recognize and avoid common logical and rhetorical fallacies.

Global Learning

Education for global learning includes understanding the diversity and multiplicity of cultural forces that shape the world through the study of cultures, gender, sexuality, race, religion, class, ethnicities, and languages with a special focus on the contributions, differences, and global perspectives of diverse cultures and societies.

1. Describe and compare different cultures.

2. Explain how various cultures contribute to the development of our multicultural world.
3. Describe and explain how race, ethnicity, class, gender, religion, sexuality and other markers of social identity impact life experiences and social relations.
4. Analyze and explain the deleterious impact and the privileges sustained by racism, sexism, ethnocentrism, classism, homophobia, religious intolerance or stereotyping on all sectors of society.
5. Demonstrate linguistic and cultural proficiency in a language other than English.

Information Literacy/Competency

Education for information competency includes progressively developing information competence skills throughout one's undergraduate career by developing a basic understanding of information retrieval tools and practices, as well as improving their ability to evaluate and synthesize information ethically.

1. Determine the nature and extent of information needed.
2. Demonstrate effective search strategies for finding information using a variety of sources and methods.
3. Locate, retrieve and evaluate a variety of relevant information, including print and electronic formats.
4. Organize and synthesize information in order to communicate effectively.
5. Explain the legal and ethical dimensions of the use of information.

Quantitative Reasoning

Education for mathematical reasoning includes gaining competence for informed judgment and decision making.

1. Represent, understand and explain mathematical information symbolically, graphically, numerically, spoken and/or signed.
2. Develop mathematical models of real-world situations and explain the assumptions and limitations of those models.
3. Use models to make predictions, draw conclusions, check whether the results are reasonable and find optimal results using technology when necessary and appropriate.
4. Demonstrate an understanding of the nature of mathematical reasoning, including the ability to prove simple results and/or make statistical inferences.

California State Polytechnic University, Pomona

Institutional Learning Goals

CPP's inclusive polytechnic education prepares students for a life of learning, contributing to their communities, and personal and professional success. CPP graduates will possess knowledge and abilities reflective of the eight elements of an inclusive polytechnic education. These elements serve as learning goals for our curricular and co-curricular learning activities.

Student learning outcomes across the university, including in academic programs, general education, and student affairs programming are written to align with these goals:

- **Application of Knowledge:** CPP graduates will apply existing and new knowledge and skills to real-world situations, opportunities, and challenges.
- **Critical Thinking and Problem Solving:** CPP graduates will use analytic and decision-making skills to identify and solve problems effectively.
- **Creativity, Discovery, and Innovation:** CPP graduates connect theory and practice to drive creativity, discovery, and innovation.
- **Diverse and Multi-disciplinary Perspectives:** CPP graduates will demonstrate awareness, understanding, and respect for diverse viewpoints—particularly those perspectives historically silenced—related to current and emerging issues across cultures and disciplines.
- **Integration of Technology:** CPP graduates will appropriately utilize and adapt to new technologies.
- **Collaborative Learning:** CPP graduates will demonstrate the ability to share and gain knowledge and skills as part of a team.
- **Community and Global Engagement:** CPP graduates are prepared to contribute to and improve local and global communities.
- **Professional and Career Readiness:** CPP graduates embody the knowledge and skills of their chosen discipline/profession.

General Education Student Learning Outcomes

- **Oral Communication**: Students will express their ideas through acts of speech with an awareness of audience, purpose, and context.
- **Written Communication**: Students will express their ideas through the written word with an awareness of audience, purpose, and form.
- **Critical Thinking**: Students will engage in the logical process of inquiry to analyze information from multiple perspectives to develop reasoned arguments.
- **Quantitative Literacy**: Students will use quantitative information to draw inferences and communicate informed arguments.
- **Information Literacy**: Students will responsibly identify, locate, and critically evaluate the array of information sources and voices necessary to engage in sound inquiry.
- Civic Literacy: Students will apply civic knowledge, associated with historical structures of power, to self-discovery and responsibility to the community.
- Intercultural Engagement: Students will integrate knowledge and relationships reflective of the diversity of human experience and forms of expression.

The college provides assessment reports for five SLO highlighted in bold above. Unfortunately, the reports require internal account access and is not public. No public information on assessment methods can be found online. Institutional Assessment Results

Private Universities – Southern California

California Institute of Technology

Institutional Learning Outcomes

Caltech provides an outstanding education that prepares students to become world leaders in science, engineering, academia, industry, and public service. The Institute aims for these educational outcomes:

- Graduates can analyze, synthesize, and communicate ideas.
- Graduates demonstrate integrity, personal and professional responsibility, and respect for others.
- Bachelor of Science graduates can identify, analyze, and solve challenging problems within and across science and engineering disciplines.
- Bachelor of Science graduates can apply their analytic skills to other areas of knowledge and understand issues important in our society.
- Master of Science graduates can apply advanced knowledge in a specialized area in preparation for their professional careers.
- Doctor of Philosophy graduates can independently identify, analyze, and solve fundamental research problems with breadth and depth.

University of Southern California

Student Learning Outcomes

1. Understand the concept of intersectionality while exploring one's identity in at least 3 social categories.
2. Articulate the role that power, privilege, and oppression play in the context of social issues.
3. Learn how to work collaboratively by applying at least three principles of good partnership.
4. Develop confidence to initiate social justice projects and make an impact.
5. Understand the historical, sociopolitical, and cultural perspectives (held by others if applicable) surrounding specific social issues.
6. Compare and critique the effectiveness of at least two approaches to addressing specific social issues.

Community Colleges – Northern California

American River College

Institutional Learning Outcomes

Upon achievement of their intended educational goal (degree, certificate, or set of courses) at American River College, students will be able to:

- Demonstrate personal and professional readiness for career and/or academic advancement.
- Demonstrate skills and behaviors which contribute to inclusive and respectful communication of diverse ideas and beliefs.
- Utilize a variety of methods to communicate effectively.
- Work cooperatively and effectively with others.
- Use various technologies to collect information and solve problems.
- Critically evaluate information to develop informed perspectives on a variety of issues, problems, and challenges.
- Contribute to society using personal knowledge, resources, and skills.
- For students earning degrees, demonstrate an understanding of basic content and methodology for the major areas of knowledge: arts and humanities, mathematics, natural sciences, and social sciences.

General Education Areas and Alignment with ISLOs

American River College is committed to the principle of providing general education which includes: **Humanities**, **Languages and Rationality**, **Living Skills**, **Natural Sciences**, **Social and Behavioral Sciences** and **Ethnic/Multicultural Studies**. All of these are basic and necessary to participate in and contribute to a balanced life in a democratic society that is diverse in its social, cultural and educational backgrounds.

Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs) Aligned with Humanities
- Demonstrate skills and behaviors which contribute to inclusive and respectful communication of diverse ideas and beliefs.
- Critically evaluate information to develop informed perspectives on a variety of issues, problems, and challenges.
- Contribute to society using personal knowledge, resources, and skills.
- For students earning degrees, demonstrate an understanding of basic content and methodology for the major areas of knowledge: arts and humanities, mathematics, natural sciences, and social sciences.

ISLOs Aligned with Languages and Rationality
English Composition Component

- Utilize a variety of methods to communicate effectively.
- Use various technologies to collect information and solve problems.
- Critically evaluate information to develop informed perspectives on a variety of issues, problems, and challenges.

Communication and Analytical Thinking Component

- Use various technologies to collect information and solve problems.
- Critically evaluate information to develop informed perspectives on a variety of issues, problems, and challenges.
- For students earning degrees, demonstrate an understanding of basic content and methodology for the major areas of knowledge: arts and humanities, mathematics, natural sciences, and social sciences.

ISLOs Aligned with Living Skills

- Demonstrate personal and professional readiness for career and/or academic advancement.
- Demonstrate skills and behaviors which contribute to inclusive and respectful communication of diverse ideas and beliefs.
- Utilize a variety of methods to communicate effectively.
- Work cooperatively and effectively with others.
- Use various technologies to collect information and solve problems.
- Critically evaluate information to develop informed perspectives on a variety of issues, problems, and challenges.

ISLOs Aligned with Natural Sciences

- Use various technologies to collect information and solve problems.
- Critically evaluate information to develop informed perspectives on a variety of issues, problems, and challenges.
- For students earning degrees, demonstrate an understanding of basic content and methodology for the major areas of knowledge: arts and humanities, mathematics, natural sciences, and social sciences.

ISLOs Aligned with Social and Behavioral Sciences

- Demonstrate skills and behaviors which contribute to inclusive and respectful communication of diverse ideas and beliefs.
- Utilize a variety of methods to communicate effectively.
- Work cooperatively and effectively with others.
- Use various technologies to collect information and solve problems.
- Critically evaluate information to develop informed perspectives on a variety of issues, problems, and challenges.

- For students earning degrees, demonstrate an understanding of basic content and methodology for the major areas of knowledge: arts and humanities, mathematics, natural sciences, and social sciences.

ISLOs Aligned with Ethnic/Multicultural Studies
- Demonstrate skills and behaviors which contribute to inclusive and respectful communication of diverse ideas and beliefs.
- For students earning degrees, demonstrate an understanding of basic content and methodology for the major areas of knowledge: arts and humanities, mathematics, natural sciences, and social sciences.

Institutional Student Learning Outcomes Assessment

Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs) at American River College are currently assessed using multiple measures.

ISLOs are assessed by **faculty** through the **Authentic Assessment Review Record (AARR)**, which involves a *review of student work demonstrating achievement of a randomly assigned course SLO*. Faculty record student achievement for the associated ISLO based on one or more authentic assessments that they regularly perform in their classes.

ISLOs are also assessed through **student surveys** and **student focus groups**. Previously, ISLOs were assessed using the Community College Survey of Student Engagement (CCSSE), a nationally normed survey of student engagement geared specifically toward community college students. To improve on alignment between survey items and the ISLOs, *a homegrown survey, developed in part through student focus groups*, will be utilized going forward (Spring 2019 onward). Importantly, this latter methodology affords the capacity to *disaggregate the ISLO assessment results by traditionally disproportionately impacted student populations*.

The overall college model of ISLO assessment is reviewed by the SLOAC on a 6-year cycle. The next review is scheduled for Spring 2023.

City College of San Francisco

Institutional Student Learning Outcomes

Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ILOs) broadly describe the knowledge or skills students achieve who meet their own educational goals at City College. These outcomes reflect the institutional mission and values of our college. ILOs represent very *broad modes of learning* that can be experienced through many paths.

ILOs guidelines are created by members of the *Academic Senate SLO Committee and Participatory Governance Assessment Planning Team in consultation with the entire CCSF Community*. They are approved by the Academic Senate Executive Council and reviewed by the Participatory Governance Council and Board of Trustees. They appear in the college catalog.

Students who successfully complete their educational programs at CCSF will achieve all or an appropriate set of the following Institutional Learning Outcomes:

- Critical Thinking and Information Competency
    1. Apply quantitative reasoning to questions or problems.
    2. Locate, evaluate, and use information appropriately.
    3. Use critical or creative reasoning, including diverse perspectives.
- Communication
    1. Communicate effectively.
    2. Demonstrate respectful interpersonal and intercultural communication.
    3. Recognize and interpret creative expression.
- Cultural, Social, and Environmental Awareness
    1. Explain the history and/or values of diverse cultures.
    2. Evaluate the impact of civic, social, and/or environmental choices.
    3. Engage effectively with others in diverse social and/or cultural settings.
- Personal and Career Development
    1. Assess one's strengths to evaluate areas for personal, academic, or career development.
    2. Make use of resources or opportunities for personal, academic, or career development.
    3. Maintain and improve one's health and safety and/or that of others.
    4. Use technology in pursuit of intellectual growth and/or career development.

No information on ILO assessment can be found online. Meanwhile, the college defines and assesses GE learning outcomes and program/course level learning outcomes.

Sacramento City College

Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs)

Upon completion of a course of study (degree or certificate) across personal, academic, and social domains, a student will be able to:

- Use effective reading and writing skills. (**Written Communication**)
- Demonstrate growth and lifelong learning skills, including healthful living, effective speaking, cross-cultural sensitivity, and/or technological proficiency. (**Life Competencies**)
- Use information resources effectively and analyze information using critical thinking, including problem-solving, the examination of how personal ways of thinking influence

reasoning, and/or the use of quantitative reasoning or methods. (**Critical Thinking and Problem Solving**)

- Apply content knowledge, demonstrate fluency, and evaluate information within his or her course of study. (**Depth of knowledge**)

Public Universities – Northern California

University of California, Berkeley

Similar to most other UC campuses, the university does not assess institutional student learning outcomes, only program level learning outcomes.

University of California, Davis

Campus goals for undergraduate learners

These goals (also called objectives) were adopted by the Academic Senate in April 2002:

1. Develop effective communication skills
   a. Written, oral, interpersonal, group
2. Develop higher cognitive skills
   a. Critical thinking, creativity, analytical ability
3. Cultivate the virtues
   a. Ethics, responsibility, honor, tolerance, respect for others, empathy
4. Develop focus and depth in one or more disciplines
5. Develop leadership skills
   a. Ability to stimulate and direct collaborative learning and collaborative action
6. Develop a global perspective
   a. Broad intellectual and cultural experience through active engagement, an understanding of the interactions among the individual, society, and the natural world
7. Prepare for lifelong learning
   a. Independent thinking and learning, learning to find information

Assessment Cycle

Learning outcomes assessment is a cyclically recurring process

1) Articulate expectations; 2) Analyze curriculum; 3) Design inquiry; 4) Collect evidence; 5) Analyze & interrogate results; 6) Act

Situate the inquiry by articulating goals for student learning and ensuring that your goals inform and are aligned to the curriculum. These preparatory steps should be revisited prior to each subsequent cycle.

Design the inquiry that will yield the evidence you need. Collect the evidence of student learning you need to answer the questions that matter. Analyze and interrogate the results for equity. Act to improve student learning. Then start again.

San Francisco State University

The university does not appear to define or assess Institutional Level Student Learning Outcomes. For Program-Level SLO, see here.

San Jose State University

Institutional Learning Outcomes

Developed in 2013 and revised in 2017, **University Learning Goals (ULG)** define the skills and knowledge of San José State University graduates at both the graduate and undergraduate level. These goals help students understand the purpose of their time at SJSU and guide academic planning and curriculum development.

1. **Social and Global Responsibilities**. An ability to consider the purpose and function of one's degree program training within various local and/or global social contexts and to act intentionally, conscientiously, and ethically with attention to diversity and inclusion.
2. **Specialized Knowledge**. Depth of knowledge required for a degree, as appropriate to the discipline.
3. **Intellectual Skills**
   a) Fluency with specific theories, assumptions, foundational knowledge, analytical and interpretive protocols, tools, and technologies appropriate to the discipline or field of study.
   b) Skills necessary for mastery of a discipline at a level appropriate to the degree and leading to lifelong learning, including critical and creative thinking and practice, effective communication, thorough and ethical information gathering and processing, competence with quantitative and/or qualitative methodologies, and productive engagement in collaborative activities.
4. **Integrative Knowledge and Skills**
   a) Mastery in each step of an investigative, creative, or practical project (e.g., brainstorming, planning, formulating hypotheses or complex questions, designing, creating, completing, and communicating) with integration within and/or across disciplines.
   b) An ability to articulate the potential impacts of results or findings from a particular work or field in a societal context.
5. **Applied Knowledge**. An ability to apply theory, practice, and problem solving to new materials, settings, and problems.

California State University, Sacramento

The university does not appear to define or assess Institutional Level Student Learning Outcomes for undergraduates. For Graduate SLO, see here.

University of San Francisco

Institutional Learning Outcomes

The Institutional Goals and Learning Outcomes represent a profile of our undergraduates at the completion of their degrees and as such, also represent a promise to our students, their families, and communities.

These learning outcomes are intended to be "student-centered" and are flexible enough to be measured using multiple forms of assessment. In addition, the ILOs are aligned with the USF mission while addressing the most current regional accreditation requirements (i.e., WSCUC Handbook of Accreditation, 2013).

Those requirements are known as the "core competencies" and include **oral communication**, **written communication**, **critical thinking**, **quantitative reasoning**, and **information literacy**. The ILOs contain very contemporary thinking about curriculum including foundational concepts of each discipline upon which thinking and practices are built, and an emphasis on a broad range of cultural understandings, awareness, and ongoing readiness to learn about others.

- Students reflect on and analyze their attitudes, beliefs, values, and assumptions about diverse communities and cultures and contribute to the common good. (**Critical Thinking**)
- Students explain and apply disciplinary concepts, practices, and ethics of their chosen academic discipline in diverse communities. (**Critical Thinking**)
- Students construct, interpret, analyze, and evaluate information and ideas derived from a multitude of sources. (**Critical Thinking; Quantitative Reasoning; Information Literacy**)
- Students communicate effectively in written and oral forms to interact within their personal and professional communities. (**Written and Oral Communication**)
- Students use technology to access and communicate information in their personal and professional lives. (**Component of Information Literacy**)
- Students use multiple methods of inquiry and research processes to answer questions and solve problems. (**Critical Thinking; Quantitative Reasoning; Information Literacy**)
- Students describe, analyze, and evaluate global interconnectedness in social, economic, environmental and political systems that shape diverse groups within the San Francisco Bay Area and the world. (**Critical Thinking**)

Private Universities – Northern California

Stanford University

The university does not provide definition and assessment of Institutional Learning Outcomes. The office provides support and oversees [assessment and evaluation](#) of:

1. Student learning outcomes at the **program level**.
2. Co-curricular program level goals.
3. Learning outcomes related to the University's accreditation by the **[Western Association of Schools and Colleges](#)** (WASC).
4. Specialized accreditations held by other colleges and individual academic programs.

For program-level learning outcome assessment methods, [see here.](#)

Additional Community Colleges

Skyline College

Skyline College shaped, adopted, and published in the College Catalog five Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs), which are derived from the AA/AS degree requirements: Effective Communication, Critical Thinking, Information Literacy, Citizenship, and Lifelong Wellness. They were updated in 2016 and are undergoing review and updating in 2022 - 2023.

Institutional Learning Outcomes Rubrics

Skyline College outlines each of the five ISLO items in a grading rubric. Each ISLO is divided into multiple indicators which are graded with the following scale: **Exceeding, Meeting, Progressing,** and **Emerging**. For detailed definitions for each ISLO rubrics, see the links below.

Critical and Creative Thinking Rubric
Students will be able to demonstrate critical and creative thinking skills in problem solving across the disciplines and in daily life.

- EXPLORING CONTEXT: identify and evaluate relevant ideas, perspectives, concepts, images, forms, sounds, and/or movements to respond to an intellectual or creative task/dilemma.
- DEVELOPING APPROACH: develop a model, approach or strategy to respond to an intellectual or creative task/dilemma.
- ADDRESSING INTELLECTUAL/CREATIVE CHALLENGE: creatively transform ideas, perspectives, concepts, images, forms, sounds, and/or movements to respond to an intellectual or creative task/dilemma.
- THINKING INNOVATIVELY: interpret, synthesize, and/or transform ideas, perspectives, concepts, images, forms, sounds, and/or movements in a novel way.

- SUPPORTING CLAIMS: support claims/conclusions with relevant and credible evidence and/or logical analysis.
- RESPONDING TO BIAS: identify and address our own biases and those of others.

Effective Communication Rubric

Students will be able to communicate and comprehend effectively.

- COMPREHENDING AND ANALYZING: comprehend and analyze verbal and nonverbal media.
- DELIVERING MESSAGE: effectively construct and deliver messages to express ideas and establish shared meaning.
- DEVELOPING A CIVIL DISCOURSE COMMUNICATION FRAMEWORK: develop a non-hierarchical communication framework that establishes shared meaning through a sensitivity and receptivity to intersectional, cultural diversity.

Citizenship Rubric – Undergoing an update in 2023

Students will be able to use knowledge acquired from their experiences at this college to be ethically responsible, culturally proficient citizens, informed and involved in civic affairs locally, nationally, and globally.

- demonstrate an understanding of their individual role in an interconnected world about a range of global issues.
- demonstrate an understanding of how global, national and local organizations, ideas, and issues are interconnected (e.g., social, cultural, economic, political, and environmental).
- demonstrate scientific literacy concerning a range of global issues.
- demonstrate awareness and sensitivity about how their perspectives are shaped by their experiences and cultural values.
- articulate similarities and contrasts among cultures, demonstrating knowledge of and sensitivity to various cultural values and issues
- recognize and apply ethical perspectives.
- facilitate a positive, supportive group environment through demonstrated collegiality and leadership.
- demonstrate commitment to active citizenship

Information Literacy Rubric

Students will be able to demonstrate skills central to information literacy.

- APPLYING RESEARCH STRATEGIES: apply effective research strategies, including formulating and defining the scope of the research question, determining key concepts, and identifying relevant sources.

- MAKING INFORMED CHOICES: make informed choices about credible and relevant information types and/or sources (journal, newspaper, magazine, interviews, media, etc.).
- EVALUATING SOURCES: critically evaluate content for credibility, accuracy, and relevance.
- ENGAGING DIVERSE VIEWS: proactively engage with diverse ideas, marginalized voices and/or world views while recognizing that information sources can be influenced by authority that is reinforced by existing power structures.
- DEMONSTRATING ETHICAL AND LEGAL USE: use verbal and/or nonverbal media ethically and legally by appropriately citing and following copyright guidelines.
- DEVELOPING A SCHOLARLY IDENTITY: develop and demonstrate scholarly identity by generating meaning rather than merely consuming and restating information.

Lifelong Wellness

Students will be able to employ practices that foster overall well-being and personal development.

- UNDERSTANDING PHYSICAL, MENTAL, AND/OR EMOTIONAL HEALTH: demonstrate an understanding of how physical, mental and/or emotional health relate to lifelong wellness.
- VALUING CREATIVE EXPRESSION: demonstrate an understanding of how creative expression and artistic practice relate to self-discovery, personal development, self-advocacy, and emotional well-being.
- EXHIBITING PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY: exhibit personal responsibility for identifying needs, determining resources, and accessing appropriate services to improve physical, mental and emotional health, and by extension, academic performance.
- EMPLOYING A GROWTH MINDSET: employ the growth mindset by embracing effort and acknowledging setbacks as a step toward proficiency, seeking out support, and negotiating challenges to gain experience and confidence.
- PRACTICING INTELLECTUAL HABITS OF MIND: practice intellectual habits of mind such as initiative, flexibility, intellectual curiosity, and an openness to diverse perspectives.

ISLO Assessment

The ISLOs are assessed with a **direct measure**. The direct measure involves the use of the above rubric, which enables faculty to have a common language and criteria around assessment.

Starting in 2021 – 2022, Skyline College will **feature one of the ISLOs each year**. Via professional development, faculty will gain insights about how to foster the featured ISLO through curriculum, pedagogy, and assessment design.

Access the **ISLO assessment calendar** for when each of the ISLOs will be assessed.

Degree bearing programs are expected to participate in the assessment of the ISLO by applying the relevant criteria from the rubric to evaluate students' work within their disciplinary framework. Specifically, degree bearing programs should assess at least one course that reinforces the featured ISLO, as indicated through the mapping, and therefore is well suited to assess the ISLO. They'll then discuss the course level results and report their findings in program review. The **Institutional Effectiveness Committee** will discuss the results in the aggregate.

The IE office at Skyline College is currently **revising the assessment rubric** of the ISLOs, with the fifth and last one (Citizenship Rubric) in the queue this semester. The process is done by a small task force from the Institutional Effectiveness Committee (IEC).

They consulted and/or worked in partnership with the appropriate constituents who may have more at stake and/or are **experts in those competencies**, such as our **Art/Music faculty** who originally proposed the integration of the creativity competency to all of our ISLOs, and **librarians for Information Literature**.

Additionally, they referenced and adapted the **AAC&U rubrics** with the focus on AA/AS and AA/AS-T degrees to inform the revisions.

Evergreen Valley College

Institutional Learning Outcomes Definition

Communication
The student will demonstrate effective communication, appropriate to the audience and purpose.

- Read and comprehend critically at appropriate level
- Write in a clear, organized fashion, at appropriate level to express ideas.
    - With clarity of expression
    - Logical in context and organization
    - Correct grammar and punctuation
- Speak in an understandable, organized fashion to explain ideas and support conclusions.
- Listen actively, respectfully and critically

Inquiry and Reasoning
The student will critically evaluate information to interpret ideas and solve problems.

- Define and analyze problems clearly
- Think independently, creatively and logically
- Apply problem solving skills
- Explain issues in quantitative terms
- Evaluate possible solutions utilizing the scientific method

Information Competency

The student will utilize information from a variety of sources to make an informed decision and take action.

- Assess the extent of information needed and develop search
- Locate and collect relevant information using appropriate technologies
- Critically evaluate sources and information
- Discuss ethical and legal issues relating to the use of information
- Use information ethically

Social Responsibility

The student will demonstrate effective interpersonal skills with people of diverse backgrounds and effectively function in group decision making.

- Demonstrate value and respect for diversity and for multiple perspectives
- Participate actively in group efforts
- Recognize broad social issues
- Demonstrate sensitivity and accountability to society
- Exhibit traits of civically responsible global citizens
- Exhibit civility in classroom and community

Personal Development

The student will demonstrate growth and self-management to promote life-long learning and personal well-being.

- Demonstrate understanding of ethical issues and make sound judgments
- Demonstrate appreciation for artistic and individual expression

It was stated that the ISLO definitions at Evergreen Valley College are under revision as of October 3, 2023. No information about SLO assessments were given.

Barstow Community College

Institutional Learning Outcomes

Communication Competency

Graduates of Barstow Community College will be able to communicate clearly, through verbal, written and visual methods while listening openly to, and observing others.

- Speaks clearly and respectfully
- Writes coherently and professionally with correct spelling, grammar and syntax
- Listens actively and acknowledges understanding
- Recognizes and understands non-verbal cues and responds appropriately
- Utilizes appropriate tone and language for intended audience and purpose
- Demonstrates college-level reading comprehension

- Communicates with culturally inclusive/sensitive considerations toward diverse and protected populations

Information Competency and Technical Skills

Graduates of Barstow Community College will be able to gather, analyze, synthesize and apply factual information from a variety of physical and technological resources in an ethical and legal manner.

- Demonstrates the ability to locate credible research and evidence utilizing appropriate tools
- Discerns factual sources of information for any research topic
- Navigates websites and understands how to determine site and content credibility
- Employs academic research skills that transition to career use
- Effectively communicates information through the utilization of technology (i.e. .doc, .ppt)

Critical Thinking and Analytic Inquiry

Graduates of Barstow Community College will be able to think critically using appropriate methods of reasoning and inquiry, including mathematical and scientific, to evaluate ideas, identify and investigate real-world issues and develop ethical, innovative, and practical solutions.

- Applies accurate and logical analysis to achieve desired outcomes
- Sorts through relevant and irrelevant information efficiently to summarize main concepts or key ideas
- Synthesizes different types of information to create new ideas or support an existing thought or idea
- Applies scientific reasoning and quantitative methods to develop solutions
- Demonstrates an ability to develop innovative solutions to real-world issues
- Utilizes tools, resources and self-guided inquiry to draw conclusions

Cultural Awareness and Civic Engagement

Graduates of Barstow Community College will be able to demonstrate skills required for living as a responsible, ethical and contributing member of a global society while exhibiting an inclusive, equity-minded, and culturally aware worldview.

- Analyzes social, economic and environmental issues from a global perspective
- Demonstrates collaborative abilities with respect for diverse perspectives
- Utilizes multicultural perspectives to apply and take steps toward addressing injustice and inequity
- Participates in opportunities to enhance cultural awareness at BCC, in the community, or globally

- Makes inquiries from an unbiased perspective to better understand various cultural and life experiences
- Utilizes gained knowledge of government and legal systems to understand complex societal issues

Personal & Professional Development

Graduates of Barstow Community College will be able to practice decision-making that demonstrates well-developed interpersonal and intrapersonal skills necessary to set and achieve lifelong personal and professional goals.

- Develops professional skills and etiquette
- Persists by overcoming challenges using input from others to adapt and grow
- Confidently networks and builds relationships, sharing with and gaining from human connections
- Accepts personal responsibility and works to build desirable character traits
- Effectively collaborates and communicates with others to accomplish set goals
- Applies gained knowledge and skills to personal and professional life situations
- Demonstrates knowledge of financial responsibility and how to ably accomplish financial goals

ISLO Assessment

At Barstow Community College, ILOs are linked to Course Student Learning Outcomes, which were measured with grades and success rates. There is an ongoing discussion on mapping courses to the overarching ILOs as opposed to its sub-categories. For example, mapping the ILO "Communications" as a whole versus its sub-categories of Writing, Speaking, and Reading as separate constructs under Communications.

As of September 26, 2023, it was stated that Barstow Community College will run a pilot assessment with the new model. Courses matching certain criteria will be chosen by the research office to see how the assessment process will look like.

West Los Angeles College

ISLO Definitions

- CRITICAL THINKING - Analyze problems by differentiating fact from opinions, using evidence and using sound reasoning to specify multiple solutions and their consequences.
- COMMUNICATION - Effectively communicate thought in a clear, well-organized manner to persuade, inform, and convey ideas in academic work, family and community settings.
- QUANTITATIVE REASONING - Identify, analyze, and solve problems that are quantitative in nature.

- SELF-AWARENESS/INTERPERSONAL SKILLS - Apply self-assessment and reflection strategies to interpersonal, work, community, career, and educational pathways.
- CIVIC RESPONSIBILITY - Apply the principles of civility to situations in the contexts of work, family, community and the global world. (Ex. Encouraging political engagement or community service)
- TECHNICAL COMPETENCE - Utilize the appropriate technology effectively for informational, academic, personal, and professional needs.
- CULTURAL DIVERSITY - Respectfully engage with other cultures in an effort to understand them. (Ex. Exploring a differing belief system)
- ETHICS - Practice and demonstrate standards of personal and professional integrity, honesty and fairness; apply ethical principles in submission of all college work. (Ex. Citing sources)
- AESTHETICS - Use multiple modes of inquiry and approaches to experience and to engage with the arts and nature; develop and express personal creative visions throughout all aspects of one's life. (Ex. Demonstrating formal analysis or a visually compelling poster)

No further information on ISLO assessment was given. It was stated that their research office is considering updating the ISLOs, and are currently pivoting the focus on ISLO development and assessments.

Cerritos College

The research office is reviewing their ISLO process. Currently their ISLOs are essentially GE SLOs.

Fullerton College

ISLO Definitions (Redesigned in February 2020)

- **Communication**: Communicate clearly and appropriately for a variety of purposes and audiences.
- **Critical Thinking and Information Competency**: Analyze and synthesize data/information in a variety of forms (numerical, textual, graphic) for the purpose of interpretation, problem-solving, and decision-making.
- **Global Systems Awareness and Ethical Citizenship**: Analyze the interconnectedness of racial, cultural, political, social, economic, and environmental issues from multiple perspectives and recognize the individual agency and collective responsibility necessary for positively influencing those systems.
- **Aesthetic Appreciation and Production**: Interpret, appreciate, and create artistic forms of knowledge and expression.
- **Personal Responsibility and Professional Development**: Articulate personal values and goals as well as explain the skills, mindsets, and behaviors necessary to achieve well-being and professional success

ISLO Assessment

It was stated that they use exit surveys (self-report measure) to assess ISLOs. They have also linked Course SLOs with Program SLOs to ISLOs via a mapping process in their eLumen software.